



Reservation Policy in Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu: A Comparative Study

Dr. Hanumant T. Kurkute¹ & More Seema Laxman²

¹Assistant Professor, Department of Political Sciences, Sangamner Municipality Arts, Damodar Jagannath Malpani Commerce and Bastiram Narayandas Sarada Science College, (Autonomous) Sangamner. MH

²Post Graduate Research Center in Political Sciences, Sangamner Municipality Arts, Damodar Jagannath Malpani Commerce and Bastiram Narayandas Sarada Science College, (Autonomous) Sangamner. MH & Assistant Professor in Sahakar Maharshi Bhausahab Santuji Thorat Arts, Science and Commerce College, Sangamner, Maharashtra, India Affiliated by Savitribai Phule Pune University, Pune, MH

Corresponding Author – Dr. Hanumant T. Kurkute

DOI - 10.5281/zenodo.20484553

Abstract:

The Constitution of India has framed public policies based on the principles of social justice, equality and inclusive development. The reservation system is one of the important instruments of those policies, which aims to provide opportunities for education, employment and representation in public life to the socially and educationally backward sections. Various states in India have implemented reservation policies according to their social and historical circumstances.

This research paper has made a comparative study of reservation policies in the states of Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu. This study has analyzed the historical background, policy design, implementation process and social impact of reservation in both the states. In the state of Tamil Nadu, the reservation rate has reached 69 percent and is maintained under special legal protection. On the other hand, the reservation structure in Maharashtra has evolved under the influence of the demands of various social groups and judicial decisions.

This comparative study shows that reservation policies play a significant role in achieving social justice. However, its implementation depends on the social structure, political will and judicial constraints of the state. The experience of Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu provides a useful perspective for the study of public policies in India.

Keywords: Reservation Policy, Social Justice, Maharashtra, Tamil Nadu, Comparative Study, Public Policy

Introduction:

India is a country made up of diverse social, cultural and economic elements. Due to the caste structure and social divisions in history, some communities have been deprived of education, employment and social opportunities for a long time. To address this historical inequality, the principle of equality was adopted in the Constitution of India.

Article 14 of the Constitution of India provides for the right to equality, while Articles

15(4) and 16(4) empower the state to make special provisions for socially and educationally backward classes. Based on these provisions, the reservation policy has evolved.

The main objective of reservation is to provide opportunities in education, employment and representation to the weaker sections of the society. This policy is considered an important tool to promote the process of social justice.

Reservation in India is implemented through the Central and State governments.

Therefore, the structure and extent of reservation are found to be different in each state.

Two states, Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu, are considered to be particularly important in terms of reservation policy. In Tamil Nadu, a comprehensive reservation system has developed due to the influence of social justice movements. In Maharashtra too, the reservation policy has evolved as per the recommendations of various backward class commissions.

A comparative study of these two states helps in studying the various forms of reservation policy in India.

Review of Literature:

Many scholars have studied reservation policy.

- 1) According to Galanter, reservation policy is a legal instrument developed to address historical inequalities (Galanter, 1984).
- 2) According to Jaffrelot, reservation has increased the political and social representation of backward communities in India (Jaffrelot, 2006).
- 3) Omvedt, while studying reservation policy in the context of social justice movements, has stated that it is an important instrument of social transformation (Omvedt, 2004).
- 4) Studies on reservation policy in the state of Tamil Nadu show that the influence of the Dravidian movement created extensive opportunities for the backward classes in this state.
- 5) The reports of various backward class commissions and court decisions are important in the context of reservation policy in Maharashtra.

Research Objectives

- 1) To study the reservation policy in the state of Maharashtra.

- 2) To understand the structure of the reservation system in the state of Tamil Nadu.
- 3) To analyze the similarities and differences in the reservation policy in both the states.
- 4) To understand the social and economic impact of the reservation policy.

Research Methodology:

Comparative and descriptive methods have been used in this research. Secondary data have been used for the study. This data includes government reports, reports of backward classes commissions, academic research articles and policy documents. Based on this data, a comparative analysis of the reservation policy in the states of Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu has been done.

Historical context of reservation in India:

The concept of reservation in India has evolved from efforts to eliminate social inequality and historical injustice. Since the structure of Indian society has been based on the caste system for a long time, some sections of society have been deprived of opportunities for education, employment and social prestige. Against this backdrop, there was a need to take special measures to bring the weaker and backward sections into the mainstream. This process led to the development of the reservation policy.

Reservation had started to some extent in the pre-independence period. During the British rule, special provisions were made in limited form in education and government jobs for the backward sections of society in some provinces of India. Especially in the Madras Presidency and the Mysore State, some policy measures were taken to provide representation to the backward classes. Due to these measures, various sections of society started getting an opportunity to participate in the administration.

During this period, many social reformers in India launched large-scale movements for social equality. Mahatma Jyotirao Phule, Chhatrapati Shahu Maharaj and other social reformers worked for the spread of education and social justice. In particular, Shahu Maharaj took an important step towards social justice by implementing reservation for the backward classes in the Kolhapur State. This initiative inspired the development of the reservation policy in the future.

After independence, India adopted a constitution based on the principles of democracy and social justice. Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar played a significant role. In addition to granting equal rights to all citizens, the Constitution also provided for special protection for socially and educationally backward classes. Under Articles 15(4) and 16(4) of the Constitution, the government was empowered to make special arrangements for backward classes in education and government jobs.

Initially, reservation was made for the Scheduled Castes (SC) and Scheduled Tribes (ST). Since these social groups had faced social discrimination and economic disadvantage for a long time, it was considered necessary to include them in the development process.

After this, various commissions were set up to study the condition of Other Backward Classes (OBC) social groups. In particular, the Mandal Commission report submitted in 1980 recommended reservation for socially and educationally backward classes. As per these recommendations, the central government implemented reservation for the OBC class in the 1990s. This decision expanded the reservation policy in India and more social groups started benefiting from it.

This historic process of reservation brought about significant changes in Indian society towards social justice and equal

opportunities. It increased the representation of backward classes in the field of education and employment and helped in their social and economic empowerment.

Overall, the history of reservation policy in India has evolved through a combined process of social struggles, reform movements and constitutional measures. Even today, this policy functions as an important tool for achieving social justice and inclusive development.

Reservation Policy in Maharashtra:

The implementation of the reservation policy in the state of Maharashtra is based on the principles of social justice, equality and empowerment of the weaker sections. Historically, social inequality was prevalent in Maharashtra. Some sections of the society were deprived of opportunities in education, employment and administration. Against this background, the reservation policy developed as an important tool to establish social justice.

The social reform movements have a great influence on the reservation policy in Maharashtra. Mahatma Jyotirao Phule, Chhatrapati Shahu Maharaj and Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar contributed greatly to the spread of social equality and education. In particular, Shahu Maharaj implemented reservation for backward classes in the Kolhapur state in 1902. This incident is considered an important milestone in the history of reservation policy in India.

After independence, special provisions were made in the Indian Constitution for socially and educationally backward sections of society. Accordingly, reservation in education and government jobs was implemented in Maharashtra for Scheduled Castes (SC), Scheduled Tribes (ST) and Other Backward Classes (OBC) sections of society. The objective of this policy is to provide equal opportunities to

the backward classes and to empower them socially and economically.

The recommendations of various backward classes commissions have influenced the reservation system in Maharashtra. These commissions studied the social and educational conditions of the state and identified the backward classes and suggested special measures for them. Based on these recommendations, the state government has tried to make the implementation of the reservation policy more effective.

At present, the reservation structure in Maharashtra is mainly based on the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes. A certain percentage has been reserved for these social groups while entering educational institutions and appointing them to government services. As per the guidelines of the Supreme Court, the total reservation rate in the state has been kept around 50 percent.

Recently, the demand for reservation for the Maratha community has led to a huge social and political debate in Maharashtra. The state government made laws to provide reservation to the Maratha community and tried to implement it. However, this decision was challenged at the judicial level. The Supreme Court's decision raised important questions about the limits of reservation and led to a wide-ranging debate on the legal framework of the reservation policy.

All these developments have made the reservation policy in Maharashtra not just an instrument of social justice but an important subject of social, political and legal debate. However, the fundamental objective of this policy is to include the backward and disadvantaged sections of the society in the process of education, employment and development.

Overall, the reservation policy in Maharashtra is playing a significant role in achieving social equality and fair distribution of

opportunities. With proper strategic planning and balanced implementation, this system can be used for the overall development of the society.

Reservation Policy in the State of Tamil Nadu:

The reservation policy in the state of Tamil Nadu is considered to be one of the most developed and comprehensive reservation systems in India. The concept of reservation in this state has evolved through a long historical process. The main objective of this policy is to reduce social inequality and provide equal opportunities to the backward classes.

The Dravidian movement has a great influence on the development of reservation in Tamil Nadu. This movement, which started in the early twentieth century, presented a stand for social justice, equality and opposition to Brahmin dominance. Due to this movement, the demand for providing more opportunities to the backward and deprived sections of the society in the fields of education, employment and political representation came to the fore. These social and political movements laid a strong foundation for reservation in Tamil Nadu.

The history of reservation in Tamil Nadu seems to have started from the British era. Some reservation was arranged for the backward classes in the Madras Presidency itself in the 1920s. After independence, the state governments expanded this policy further. The reservation structure was developed based on the recommendations of various commissions.

At present, the total reservation in Tamil Nadu is about 69 percent. This reservation includes Backward Classes (BC), Most Backward Classes (MBC), Scheduled Castes (SC) and Scheduled Tribes (ST). The reservation rate for Backward Classes is higher in Tamil Nadu compared to many other states. The objective of this policy is to provide opportunities in the field

of education and employment to the majority of the backward classes in the society.

The state government made a special law to provide legal protection to the reservation system in Tamil Nadu and this law was included in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution of India. Due to inclusion in the Ninth Schedule, this law has received some judicial protection. Therefore, the reservation system of Tamil Nadu is considered to be relatively more stable and effective.

Due to this reservation policy, the representation of backward classes in education and government services in Tamil Nadu has increased significantly. Many students have got opportunities for higher education and the process of social and economic progress has progressed rapidly. Also, the process of social equality has been strengthened due to the increased participation of various sections of society in the administration and public institutions.

Overall, the reservation policy in the state of Tamil Nadu is considered an important model in terms of achieving social justice and inclusive development. The impact of social movements, sound policy decisions and widespread implementation show that the reservation system is working effectively in this state.

Comparative Analysis:

Although the reservation policy in both Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu aims at creating social justice and equal opportunities, its design, implementation and results differ in some respects. Historical background, social movements and political situation have led to differences in the reservation systems of both the states. The table below provides comparative information about the reservation system in both the states.

Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu Reservation System: Comparative Table

| Elements | Maharashtra | Tamil Nadu |
|-----------------------|--|--|
| Reservation Rate | About 50% | About 69% |
| Historical Background | Influenced by social reform movements and recommendations of various commissions | Strongly influenced by the Dravidian social justice movement |
| Major Beneficiaries | Scheduled Castes (SC), Scheduled Tribes (ST), Other Backward Classes (OBC) | Backward Classes (BC), Most Backward Classes (MBC), Scheduled Castes (SC), Scheduled Tribes (ST) |
| Legal Status | Implemented within the limits set by the Supreme Court (around 50%) | Reservation law protected under the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution |
| Social Impact | Increased representation of historically disadvantaged groups in education and government services | Wider social participation and greater access to education and employment opportunities |

This comparative analysis shows that the extent of reservation in Tamil Nadu is higher than in Maharashtra and its structure is more comprehensive. Due to the Dravidian movement, special emphasis was placed on the empowerment of backward classes in Tamil Nadu. Due to this, the representation of these classes in education and government jobs has increased to a large extent.

The development of the reservation policy in Maharashtra has been influenced by social reform movements. The ideas of Mahatma Phule, Shahu Maharaj and Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar strengthened the concept of social justice. However, due to the limitations imposed by the Supreme Court, the extent of reservation has been generally kept around 50 percent.

In terms of social impact, reservation has increased the representation of backward classes

in both the states. However, in Tamil Nadu, social participation has increased to a greater extent due to comprehensive reservation, while in Maharashtra, reservation has provided opportunities to various social classes in the field of education and employment.

Opportunities and Challenges:

Although reservation policy is an important tool for achieving social justice, its implementation presents many opportunities and some significant challenges. In both the states of Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu, the reservation policy has brought about some positive changes, but at the same time it has also created some social, political and legal difficulties.

Opportunities:

1. Increasing social equity: The reservation policy has provided an opportunity to historically backward and disadvantaged sections of society to participate in the mainstream. The process of social equity has been strengthened by increasing representation in education, employment and administration. This has helped in increasing the sense of equality among various sections of society.

2. Increasing access to education: Reservation has made higher education opportunities more available to backward class students. Many students who were not able to get educational opportunities earlier have started getting admission in colleges, universities and professional education institutions. This has increased the spread of education and given a boost to social development.

3. Promoting economic progress: Increased opportunities in education and government jobs have improved the economic condition of many families. Stable employment and income have improved the living standards of the backward classes. This has helped in long-term economic progress.

4. Increased social representation: Reservation has increased the representation of various sections of society in the administration, educational institutions and various public sectors. This has created more inclusiveness in the decision-making process.

Challenges:

1. Judicial limits: Judicial limits are an important issue in the implementation of reservation. The Supreme Court has generally set a limit of 50 percent for reservation. Due to this, sometimes state governments have to face legal difficulties while providing reservation to new sections of society.

2. Political pressure: Reservation is often the focus of political discussions and debates. The demands of various sections of society create political pressure on the government. Sometimes decisions taken keeping in mind political interests can create a challenge to long-term social equality.

3. Social tension: Reservation is likely to create dissatisfaction and tension among some sections of society. Especially if there is a disagreement over the distribution of reservation, a situation of conflict can arise in the society. Therefore, it is necessary to maintain social balance while implementing the reservation policy.

4. Unequal distribution of benefits: Sometimes the benefits of reservation do not reach the weakest sections of the society equally. Therefore, transparency and effective planning are necessary in its implementation to fully achieve the objective of the policy.

Conclusion:

A comparative study of the reservation policy in the states of Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu clearly reveals various aspects of the process of social justice. The basic objective of reservation in both the states is the same, which is to provide equal opportunities to the socially and

educationally backward sections. However, the design and implementation of this policy are different in both the states due to the historical background, social movements and political situation.

The reservation policy in Tamil Nadu has developed in a more comprehensive and long-term form. Due to the influence of the Dravidian movement, special emphasis was placed on social equality in this state. Due to this, the backward and extremely backward sections of society have received a large amount of representation in education and government jobs. In Tamil Nadu, the reservation system is considered to be relatively more stable as it is included in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution.

On the other hand, the reservation policy in Maharashtra has developed under the influence of social reform movements. The concepts of social justice were strengthened by the thoughts of Mahatma Phule, Shahu Maharaj and Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar. The reservation structure in Maharashtra has evolved within constitutional constraints and has been modified from time to time in response to the demands of various sections of society. In particular, the demands for reservation by some sections of society have given rise to social and political debate in the state.

This comparative study shows that the reservation policy plays an important role in removing historical injustices in society and bringing the weaker sections into the mainstream. The increase in education and employment opportunities has helped in the social and economic empowerment of the backward classes.

However, there are some challenges in implementing the reservation policy. Maintaining a balance between social equity and merit, ensuring transparency and fair implementation of the policy are important issues. It is also necessary to reconsider the reservation policy and

make necessary amendments in accordance with the changing social situation.

Overall, the reservation policy is a very important tool for social justice and inclusive development in Indian society. The experiences of both the states of Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu make it clear that the reservation system can make a significant contribution to reducing inequality in society through proper policy planning and effective implementation.

References:

1. Marc Galanter, M. (1984). *Competing Equalities: Law and the Backward Classes in India*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press. pp. 34–56, 112–145.
2. Christophe Jaffrelot, C. (2006). *India's Silent Revolution: The Rise of the Lower Castes in North India*. New Delhi: Columbia University Press. pp. 98–120, 215–230.
3. Gail Omvedt, G. (2004). *Ambedkar: Towards an Enlightened India*. New Delhi: Penguin Books. pp. 65–89.
4. Constitution of India. (1950). *The Constitution of India*. New Delhi: Government of India Press. Articles 14, 15(4), 16(4), pp. 12–18.
5. Mandal Commission
6. Government of India. (1980). *Report of the Backward Classes Commission (Mandal Commission)*. New Delhi: Government of India. Vol. 1, pp. 52–75.
7. Maharashtra State Backward Class Commission
8. Government of Maharashtra. (2018). *Report of the Maharashtra State Backward Class Commission*. Mumbai: Government of Maharashtra. pp. 102–140.
9. Tamil Nadu Backward Classes Commission
10. Government of Tamil Nadu. (2011). *Tamil Nadu Backward Classes Commission Report*.

- Chennai: Government of Tamil Nadu. pp. 45–78.
11. Indra Sawhney vs Union of India (1992)
12. Supreme Court of India. (1992). Indra Sawhney v. Union of India. AIR 1993 SC 477. pp. 529–560.
13. Jaishri Laxmanrao Patil vs Chief Minister of Maharashtra (2021)
14. Supreme Court of India. (2021). Jaishri Laxmanrao Patil v. Chief Minister of Maharashtra. Supreme Court of India Judgment. pp. 310–345.
15. Tamil Nadu Reservation Act 1993
16. Government of Tamil Nadu. (1993). Tamil Nadu Backward Classes, SC and ST (Reservation of Seats in Educational Institutions and Appointments in the Services under the State) Act. Chennai: Government Press. pp. 1–25.