



“A CRITICAL ANALYSIS ON MONTESSORI AND FROBEL EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION CONCEPT”

Naziya Khanum

Ph.D Research Scholar, Education Dept. Karnataka State Akkamahadevi Women's University, Vijaypura Dist, Karnataka.

Corresponding Author- Naziya Khanum

Email id nazyakhanumnk44@gmail.com

DOI- 10.5281/zenodo.7266832

Abstract:

The foundation for future learning, personal growth, and development is laid by elementary education. The two most prevalent models for innovative early childhood learning concept are the Montessori, Frobel education Concept. Each of these strategies has a long history of promoting children's educational freedom and has witnessed continuous improvement. Early childhood teachers and academics can better comprehend the objectives, philosophical and theoretical foundations, advantages, and drawbacks of these concepts and their practice-oriented approaches from this narrative analysis. Understanding these alternatives to established educational approaches are crucial as early education develops with technology and as conceptions of childhood education change. This analysis enables educators to think about these models' uses and cultural competency in particular local and community contexts. So this critical analysis contribute to frame well structured curriculum of elementary education according to environment settings by following footsteps of Montessori and Frobel approach.

Key Words: Elementary Education, Montessori, Frobel, Early Childhood Education.

Introduction

The foundational stage of a child's education is elementary school. It is essential to one's educational journey. Assisting children in learning reading, writing, math, and creativity as well as character development, critical thinking, logical reasoning, communication and socialization skills, behavioral, social, cultural, cognitive, physical, and emotional growth, elementary education plays specific roles in a child's life. In general, early education is mainly focused on the child's early phases of development. To improve early childhood learning and opportunity, it is important to comprehend and be aware of alternate approaches for delivering early childhood education programmes. This analysis discusses the distinctive features of two alternative curricula—Montessori and Frobel education Concept—as well as comparisons between the models and an analysis of their applicability for more widespread international adoption. Many early childhood communities, especially those outside of the

United States, could benefit from learning how other cultures use different early childhood alternatives because they often lack knowledge of other educational methods (Hyun 2006; Rogoff 2003; Phillips and Schweisfurth 2008).

The Montessori Approach

Maria Montessori established the Montessori Method in 1907. Maria Montessori was an Italian scientist who created her educational philosophy using methods of scientific observation. Her method continues to this day to emphasise watching children learn and modifying the learning environment depending on instructors' observations. In order to learn, children are encouraged to experiment and make mistakes.

Principles of Theory

❖ The cognitive-constructivist philosophy serves as the foundation for the Montessori Method. In line with another cognitive constructivist, Jean Piaget, Montessori thought that children learn in distinct stages.

- ❖ Montessori Method has first two stages—birth to age 3 and ages 3 to 6—represent the "unconscious absorbent mind" and the "conscious absorbent mind," respectively.

Based on the aforementioned two stages of development, Montessori's multi-age classrooms are divided into groups.

Role of the Teacher:

- ❖ The Montessori teacher carefully arranges the resources and activities in the classroom to accommodate each student's individual interests, intellectual level, and developmental requirements. She gradually introduces these to each child, laying the groundwork for independent learning.
- ❖ Each student's progress toward acquiring a particular topic or ability is constantly monitored by the teacher. She is aware of when to intervene to provide extra guidance and when to push a learner to the next level.
- ❖ A skillful observer is a Montessori instructor. The Montessori teacher learns about each student's interests, learning preferences, and temperament via attentive observation. She is attentive to the student's "sensitive periods," when he is most prepared to master a new concept or ability, and she is aware of his developmental needs.
- ❖ Using this knowledge, the instructor selects resources and classes that will hold the student's interest and motivate him to study.
- ❖ Teacher gives new lessons that get more difficult and abstract as soon as she notices that the learner has mastered a subject or ability. The teacher adapts the learning environment and materials in the classroom as the pupils advance to meet their evolving needs.
- ❖ The teacher serves as an example of virtues like compassion, understanding, and tolerance of individual differences by her own actions and attitudes. She exhorts the students to demonstrate respect and kindness. Additionally, she engages kids in group projects that promote respect, responsibility, and teamwork.

Role of a Student

- ❖ In a Montessori setting, students play an important role. By selecting a topic and engaging in the activities for as long as they

like, individuals can follow their interests. By using the instructional materials and autonomously learning new ideas, students gain knowledge. Since most instructional resources are self-correcting, students can check their own work, which gives them the freedom to study at their own speed and develop greater independence.

- ❖ In a Montessori classroom, there may be a large number of students engaged in various activities. Children can learn from one another in a classroom setting, but this can also cause problems. For this reason, Montessori schools encourage kids to respect one another and their work.
- ❖ The kids must place their hands behind their backs and ask respectfully for permission to watch a classmate work when they want to observe. Children are taught to respect one another and refrain from interfering with someone else's concentration.

Unique Features of Montessori Classroom

Environmentally Prepared:

The significance of a prepared environment is the first tenet of Montessori education. Classrooms are viewed as empowering spaces where students can enjoy learning.

Materials:

The special resources utilized to facilitate learning make up the second tenet of a Montessori education. It is only possible to provide a prepared atmosphere when the contents provided are open to all.

Guided by the teacher:

The teacher's position forms the last tenet in a Montessori classroom. The instructor is frequently seen as a leader who directs the student based on their unique needs.

Friedrich Froebel's kindergarten

German educator Friedrich Froebel is credited with creating the kindergarten. According to him, "play is the highest expression of human growth in childhood since it is the only way that the child's spirit can freely express itself." Froebel claimed that via hands-on experience, children build their knowledge of the world through play. His viewpoints on play and the value of learning from nature have been widely accepted.

Principles of Froebel Philosophy

Absolute idealism characterises Froebel's philosophy. The idealistic philosophy of prominent German idealists like Kant, Hegel, and Fichte had an impact on him.

Important Characteristics of Frobelian Approach:

According to Froebel education, there should be a strong connection between home and school and that parent are children's first educators. Teaching the whole child in all developmental domains—socially, academically, emotionally, physically, and spiritually—is the major objective of a Froebel education.

The Froebelian Approach is primarily comprised of four elements: **motor expression, social interaction, unrestricted self-expression, and creativity.**

The Froebel Approach places an emphasis on:

- **Play Motivates Education :**
The biological desire to understand how things function is satisfied through play. According to Froebel schooling, play should be active and purposeful rather than mindless, and it should help children develop their sense of purpose.
- **Children can only learn what they are ready to learn.**
Children should be permitted to learn at their own developmental speed because they develop at different rates.
- **The teacher should act as a guide.**
Teachers should be seen as mentors who may help a youngster reach comprehension rather than as the custodians of knowledge.

A Comparative Analysis of Montessori Approach and Frobelian Approach of Teaching for Elementary Students:-

Provision of nursery education	Froebel and Montessori both designed their institutions with the purpose of teaching young children between the ages of 3 and 7. Thus, they both made significant contributions to nursery education.
Child-centeredness	Child-centered education was emphasized by both educators. Both emphasized the importance of the child's inner growth. For kids, they sacrificed their lives. They pushed for a pleasant, loving environment for the kids. They viewed the classrooms as temples, and the students as living deities there.

The environment in the classroom ought to be prepared.

Although Froebelian classrooms may appear to be set up for unstructured play, they are actually very meticulously prepared and provide kids with the resources that are best suited to their stage of development. Young learners must move about a lot. The finger plays, singing, and many types of movement in Froebelian schools are vibrant.

The Role of Teachers in Play way Method:-

The teacher organizes learning exercises from simple concept to complicated concept. The teacher's role as a leader, supervisor, and guide for the students during the learning process is essential. Play way activities must be used to evaluate the students. Evaluation must not be ignored. Playing is the main component of this approach. The children' learning is rejuvenated. Their capacity for learning is improved. Therefore, it is a skilled teacher's responsibility to also apply the best elements of this play-based learning approach at the higher levels of teaching and learning.

The Role of Child in Play way Method

Play is incorporated into the learning process, making it enjoyable for kids. Children grow to feel satisfied as a result of it. Every child receives an equal amount of exposure and learning and involvement opportunities. It also inculcates in a child a variety of other abilities in addition to information. It makes it easier for kids to interact with their teachers and friends. It makes holistic and all-around development easier.

Learning Environment	Both organizations understood the value of a suitable, attractive, and welcoming workplace. Both agreed that there should be plenty of flowers, plants, and other living things around to make youngsters happy. Froebel established the "Kindergarten," and Montessori established the "Children House" as a way to protect children from the unhealthy surroundings of society.
Sense training	Both emphasized the value of sense training and created unique tools and techniques for doing so.
self-expression	Both emphasized the need of engaging in self activity, self-expression. In the Children's House as well as the Kindergarten, self activity is crucial.
Provision of play-way methods	Both educators supported play-based approaches to teaching. It should be observed that play is valued more highly in the Froebelian approach than in the Montessori approach, and vice versa.
Individual Freedom	Both supported children's right to personal autonomy. They resisted any and all limitations placed on the child by adults.
Idealists philosophy	They were idealists, these teachers. For Montessori, a child is like God. Froebel sought to achieve spiritual unification through education.

A Critical Analysis on contrary views of Montessori Approach and Frobelian Approach of Teaching for Elementary Students:-

Scientific vs. philosophical approaches	
There is no metaphysical theory in the Montessori method. Her educational approach is grounded in science. Her educational philosophies were developed through observation, experimentation, and other scientific techniques.	There is intellectual component to Froebel's Kindergarten. He gave his approach a metaphysical interpretation. He held the views that God is in responsible of the world and that everything in the universe is related.
Emphasis on group instruction rather than individual instruction	
Children are taught in groups in kindergarten.	The Montessori educational method emphasizes a child's uniqueness as its guiding principle. Every child develops independently and at his or her own speed. She not allowed from using group or classroom teaching. Because it limit the child's uniqueness.
Social versus individual tendencies	
Children in kindergarten cooperate and play in groups. There are various group activities that promote social inclinations, such as music, games, and plays.	The Montessori approach is primarily individualistic. Furniture arrangement, room cleaning, and food serving are the only group activities.
Gifts versus Didactic tools for training the senses	
Froebel's Kindergarten, the child receives special gifts for sensory development	The Montessori method uses didactic tools to develop the senses.
Manual versus daily life activities	

Froebel's Kindergarten places a high value on manual tasks including clay modeling, paper cutting, gardening, and nature studies.	In the Montessori method, practical everyday tasks like dressing and undressing, setting tables, cleaning rooms, etc. are given significant importance.
Place for songs, poetry and tales	
The primary elements in kindergarten include songs, poetry, and stories. Froebel highlighted the need of using stories, poetry, and songs to stimulate children's imaginations. Songs, poetry.	Stories and songs have no place in the Montessori educational method. Since she does not consider it to be a part of a child's existence, Montessori completely disregards the development of the imagination.
Scope for math, writing, and reading	
The three R's (reading, writing, and arithmetic) are ignored in kindergarten	The three R's (reading, writing, and arithmetic) are given their proper place in the Montessori approach.
Role of a Teacher	
The kindergarten teacher acts as a gardener who tends to the small people plants. He controls the children's activities. His interference is possible	The teacher in the Montessori method is merely a directress. She is merely keeping an eye on things. She only offers advice when requested.
Applications of the Approach in Real Life	
To help students understand the nature of the physical world, they should be exposed to the outside world through play. Playing in the actual world helps pupils put their information into context (He is very much against ROTE learning).	The Montessori classroom places a strong emphasis on sensory and practical learning. The teacher assigns a task and encourages children to complete it without support from an adult. Lessons are task-oriented.
Class Grouping	
The Froebel concept makes no reference of any particular age grouping requirements.	The multi-age classrooms used by the Montessori Method are based on predetermined developmental stages (0 – 3 and 3 – 6). The Montessori method makes extensive use of this multi-age approach.
Views on Childhood	
Froebel thought of kids as having choice. Through interaction with everyday items, he thought, kids strive to make sense of the world. Therefore, it is important to provide kids the opportunity to explore (this emphasis on freedom is in line with the "agentive" notion).	According to Montessori, kids are "active." This demonstrates that she views kids as capable of developing themselves. By giving a resource-rich environment, kids can learn and discover things on their own.

Conclusion:-

From the above critical analysis it had been find elementary education plays an important role in early development stages of children's. Earlier there was no structured elementary education. But few of eminent educationists made an attempt to frame structured elementary education pattern by following different philosophy of education.

Naziya Khanum

Among them most prominent are Maria Montessori an Italian scientist she established Montessori Method in 1907. she followed pragmatic philosophy and develop an approach providing didactic training to train the senses. Froebel German Educationist developed Play Way Method .hence on their both education many similarities and contrary elements had been analyzed. But

this critical analysis offer many suggestions to Research Scholar, Teacher Educators and Teacher Trainees to understand its significance, philosophical foundation, practical application of each of this concept. And this analysis presents a clear interpretation to understand Montessori and Frobelian concept of education with resemblance and contrary aspects. It helps to decide in which education setting which type of concept is most suitable. And it offer future research suggestion whether we can develop the elementary education concept with amalgamation of this both concept of education.

References:

1. Haifa Aljabreen (2020), "Montessori, Waldorf, and Reggio Emilia: A Comparative Analysis of Alternative Models of Early Childhood Education", *International Journal of Early Childhood* (2020) 52:337–353,
2. Marshall, C (2017), Montessori education: a review of the evidence base. *npj Science Learn* 2, 11 retrieved from: <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41539-017-0012-7>
3. Sartaj Ahmad Bhat (2021), "Educational Philosophy of Maria Montessori: A Coordination between the Teacher and Child", *International Journal of Advanced Multidisciplinary Scientific Research (IJAMSR)* Vol 4, Issue 11
4. Rayees Ahmad Dar (2020), Fredric august Froebel kindergarten system and his main contribution to education, *International Journal of Advanced Multidisciplinary Scientific Research (IJAMSR)*, Volume 3, Issue 9
5. S. Sunay yildirim(2015), "Efficacy of Montessori education in attention gathering skill of children